



EU Must Bring Its Expertise to Pakistan

An Expert Survey by Atlantic-Community.org

June 18, 2009

Written and Conducted by:
Nathalie Chwalisz and Urs Schrade
Editors at atlantic-community.org

Atlantische Initiative e.V.
Wilhelmstraße 67
10117 Berlin

Tel.: 030/206 337 88
Fax: 030/206 337 90
Email: info@atlantic-community.org

Directors: Dr. Johannes Bohnen und Jan-Friedrich Kallmorgen
Editor-in-Chief: Jörg Wolf

Table of Contents

Introduction	p. 2
1 Pakistan's Instability Impacts European Security Concerns	p. 3
2 Guiding Principles: Democracy, Institutionbuilding and Civil Society	p. 4
3 EU Should Complement US Policy by Sharing its Expertise in Non-Military State-building	p. 5
List of Survey Participants	p. 6

Introduction

This expert survey was conducted by Atlantic-Community.org, the internet think tank on foreign policy, in advance of the first-ever EU-Pakistan summit on June 16, 2009. The survey sought to gather and analyze the opinions of leading international specialists on two important aspects of the EU-Pakistan relationship: first, how ongoing instability in Pakistan impacts European security concerns, and second, how EU policy should be shaped in order to prevent the Pakistani state from failing.

Thirty experts from India, Pakistan, several EU countries, and the United States participated in this survey. They represent leading research institutions and think tanks such as the Brookings Institute, the Carnegie Foundation, the French Institute of International Relations, Bradford University, India's Institute of Defense Studies & Analysis (IDSA), and many others (for a full list of participants, please see page 6).

This survey focused on expert opinions and recommendations concerning European Union foreign policies towards Pakistan. The policy analysts shared with Atlantic Community their ideas on how the EU is affected by state failure in Pakistan and how the EU should act to help Pakistani authorities reestablish stable political structures in their country. The results of were published on Atlantic-Community.org on June 18, 2009.

The survey focused on three questions:

1. How does Pakistan's political instability impact EU security concerns?

All participants believed that instability in Pakistan has a number of significant ramifications for European security issues. Among these concerns, the experts highlighted the increasing risk of terrorist violence on European soil, the proliferation of WMDs, and the threat to state-building efforts in Afghanistan.

2. What should be the guiding principles of Europe's foreign policy in the region?

According to the majority of the experts, Europe's foreign policy in Pakistan should be guided by the principle of fostering democracy. To this end, Europe should engage itself particularly in institution-building and institutional reforms, economic assistance, and measures to strengthen civil society.

3. How could/should the EU's policy vis-à-vis Pakistan compliment US policy in the region?

Most of the experts agree that Europe can play a crucial role in Pakistan. They see the EU as better poised to perform crucial non-military tasks in state-building and the reform of state institutions, as the EU has had significant experience in these areas with its eastern neighbors.



1. Pakistan's Instability Impacts European Security Concerns

The surveyed experts agreed that instability in Pakistan has a number of ramifications for EU security issues. The main concerns include terrorism, the proliferation of WMDs, and the threat to state-building efforts in Afghanistan.

The majority of the specialists agree that the most serious concern for the EU is the increasing risk of terrorist attacks within European territory. **Dr. Robert L Canfield** (Washington University of St Louis) warned that Pakistan's political instability leads to the emergence of safe havens for terrorist groups where it would be possible to conduct terrorist training camps and plan terrorist attacks without interference from state authorities. This has a direct consequence on the security of European countries because, as **Dr. Christian Wagner** (German Institute for International and Security Affairs) states, "terrorists from Pakistan/Europe/other countries are getting training in terror camps on Pakistani territory for attacks in their home countries." Bradford University's **Dr. Yunas Samad** said that already "a number of terrorist attacks in EU countries have a link to Pakistan and instability in the country would make the danger of these developments increase."

With regard to the proliferation issue, experts emphasize that Pakistan's nuclear warheads might fall into the hands of Pakistani terrorists and insurgents leading to a security nightmare for Europe and the US. Terrorism and South Asia expert **Dr. Peter Lehr** (Center for the Study of Terrorism and Political Violence) points out that "the idea of an Islamic bomb still has currency in certain Islamist circles." At the same time, he stresses the possibility of nuclear bombs and warheads being smuggled into European countries or the US. Experts like **Chris Mason** (Naval Postgraduate School) pointed out the "compromised integrity of Pakistan's nuclear weapons program," which exposes the possible risk of nuclear weapons know-how or nuclear weapons components being transferred from the Pakistani state to terrorist or subnational groups (**Dr. Sayed Wiqar Ali Shah**, Quaid-i-Azam University).

Finally, most of the experts agree that a successful outcome of the state-building mission in Afghanistan is not possible without a stable and secure Pakistan. Without the presence of Pakistani authorities, the Taliban can retreat, regroup and re-equip in Pakistan and the border regions, which subsequently allows them to put severe pressure on the International Security Assistance Force (ISAF) in Afghanistan. Likewise, as **Bruce Riedel** (Brookings Institution) notes, "Pakistan is the key supply line for NATO in Afghanistan. Stability in Afghanistan is impossible without Pakistan's help."



2. Guiding Principles: Democracy, Institution-building, and Civil Society

The majority of the experts agreed that European foreign policy should aim to create longterm stability by fostering democratic governance. This is best accomplished by reforming state institutions and strengthening Pakistan's civil society.

The priority for the European Union should be to "strengthen Pakistan's will and capability to counter terrorism," according to EU Counter-Terrorism Coordinator **Gilles de Kerchove**. The experts identify the need for a long-term strategy aiming towards stability in Pakistan as the guiding principle of EU involvement in the region. **Dr. Shaun Gregory** (Head of Pakistan Security Research Unit, Bradford University) calls for the European Union's objective to be the "enfranchisement, empowerment and economic and social well-being" of the Pakistani people.

The respondents place an overwhelming emphasis on the importance of fostering democratic governance in Pakistan. In strong agreement, they call for the European Union to work on strengthening Pakistan's civil society and help its government to reform state institutions and services, including its tax and education systems, and to create a more egalitarian society. Furthermore, multiple experts recommend that the European Union should aid Pakistan in reforming and strengthening its civilian security institutions and its justice sector. **Fabrice Pothier**, (Carnegie Endowment for Peace Europe), says that this could take the form of funding, mentoring, and training. The recommended strategy would preempt the destabilizing discontent of the dominant young, disenfranchised generation. **Dr. Rodney Jones** (United States Institute of Peace), points out that the rule of law combined with democratic institutions and processes may be "necessary pre-requisites for the public to grasp its own interests in countering extremism and terrorism."

However, there is also disagreement regarding this point: **Dr. Lehr** argues that the currently civilian, democratically elected government appears to be "utterly incompetent and unable to effectively deal with the challenge of radical Islam." Europe, he contends, needs to be prepared for the option of a military take-over, which might even provide better stability than the democratic path.

Moreover, the majority of participants call for a European Union strategy to improve Pakistani economic development, including, as **Fabrice Pothier** suggests "supporting Pakistan's trade integration in the region as well as in the global economy" and, as Dr. Wagner specifies, "promoting investment and economic cooperation."

Dr. Gregory's words summarized the dominant concern: "A state which fails to deliver security, education, economic opportunity, basic needs, political and human rights [...] is creating the context for ever greater extremism and violence," a development the European Union must work to counter.



3. EU Should Complement US Policy with its Expertise in Non-Military State-building

According to most of the experts, Europe is better poised to perform crucial non-military tasks in state-building and institutional reform than the US. Dealings with their eastern neighbors have given the EU significant experience in these areas.

While the analysts agree that the US is the dominant external actor in Pakistan, especially regarding security, they express the need for strong European Union involvement, and even "support of the US strategy" (**Dr. Nazif Shahrani**, Indiana University). **Alok Rashmi Mukhopadhyay** (Institute for Defense Studies & Analyses) asserts that Europe has an important role in the Pakistan region, and indeed its interests are more directly affected by any instability there than those of the US.

The majority of specialists argue that Europe is better poised to perform crucial non-military tasks, such as institution building, trade cooperation, post-conflict reconstruction and aid. The dominant conclusion was that the US was neither interested nor best prepared for long-term involvement in nation-building, fostering democratic institutions, economic development, and civil society (**Jari Lindholm**). The experts concluded that Europe should use its experience in applying "soft power" (**Dr. Lehr**) and establishing long-term, positive Western engagement in the region. As EU Counter-Terrorism Coordinator **Gilles de Kerchove** states: "the EU's biggest area of comparative advantage is in state building and the reform of state institutions. In the domain of counter terrorism, our experience with law enforcement and judicial reform is of particular value." This should be done within close cooperation with the US (**Bruce Riedel**) as well as other regional players, namely China and Saudi Arabia, in a "Friends of Democratic Pakistan" Consortium (**Christian Wagner**).

In the short term, the European Union can provide the crucial "response to the immediate humanitarian and security emergency," specifically the Internally Displaced People (IDP) uprooted by the fighting in the Swat Valley (**Fabrice Pothier**).

The survey participants agree that the European Union's perceived neutrality and its comparatively positive image among Pakistan's population were its strength. Its neutrality, **Dr. Yunas Samad**, **Gregor Enste** (Heinrich Böll Stiftung) and **Dr. Matteo Tondini** (Institute for Advanced Studies Lucca) highlight, would be an asset in working towards a peace process between India and Pakistan. **Dr. Rodney Jones** pointed out that it was paramount to recognize Pakistan's legitimate security concerns regarding this neighbor. Until these are addressed and alleviated, Pakistan's security establishment will neither be able nor willing to direct the necessary resources to the fight against the insurgents (**Dr. Yunas Samad**). The European Union has a role to play in promoting greater regional cooperation and trade integration - an area many experts identified as another strength.

Overwhelmingly, the specialists hope that the European Union will define a strong vision for its strategic involvement in Pakistan.

List of Surveyed Participants

Thomas Bärthlein, Expert for Pakistan, Deutsche Welle, DE

Gilles Boquerat, Institut Français des Relations Internationales, FR

Robert L Canfield, Professor, Washington University of St Louis, US

David Edwards, Williams College, US

Marie Elseroad, International Foundation for Electoral Systems, US/AF

Gregor Enste, Resident Director, Heinrich Böll Stiftung Pakistan, PK

Shaun Gregory, Head of Pakistan Security Research Unit, University of Bradford. UK

Abudlhadi Hairan, Reporter based in Afghanistan, Ground Report, AF

Malou Innocent, Foreign Policy Analyst, Cato Institute, US

Thomas H. Johnson, Research Professor, CCS Director, Naval Postgraduate School, US

Rodney Jones, Program Officer, United States Institute of Peace, US

Gilles de Kerchove, EU Counter-Terrorism Coordinator, Council of the European Union, BE

Rashid Ahmad Khan, Senior Research Fellow, Islamabad Policy Research Institute, PK

Peter Lehr, Terrorism and South Asia Expert, Centre for the Study of Terrorism and Political Violence, DE

Jari Lindholm, Helsinki-based reporter for the Finnish newsweekly Suomen Kuvalehti, FI

Chris Mason, Senior Research Fellow with the Program for Culture & Conflict Studies, Naval Postgraduate School, US

Péter Marton, Corvinus University of Budapest and Atlantic Community Member

Margaret Mills, Professor, Ohio State University, US

Alok Rashmi Mukhopadhyay, Associate Fellow, Institute for Defense Studies & Analyses, IN
Vinod Patney, Indian Pugwash Society, IN

Fabrice Pothier, Director of Carnegie Europe, BE

Aziz Rafiee, Managing Director, Afghan Civil Society Forum, AF

Helmut Reifeld, Head of Team "Planning and Concepts," Konrad-Adenauer-Stiftung, DE

Bruce Riedel, Senior Fellow, The Brookings Institution, US

Yunas Samad, University of Bradford, UK

Sima Samar, Chairperson, Afghanistan Independent Human Rights Commission, AF

Sayed Wiqar Ali Shah, Professor, Quaid-i-Azam University. Islamabad, PK

M. Nazif Shahrani, Professor of Central Asian and Middle Eastern Studies, Indiana University, US

Matteo Tondini, Researcher & Legal Advisor, Institute for Advanced Studies Lucca, IT

Christian Wagner, Research Director, German Institute for International and Security Affairs, DE

Produced by

ATLANTIC-COMMUNITY.ORG



Written and Conducted by: Natalie Chealish and Urs Schrade
Directors: Dr. Johannes Bohnen & Jan-Friedrich Kallmorgen
© ATLANTIC-COMMUNITY.ORG – Wilhelmstrasse 67 – 10117 Berlin – Germany
Tel: +49 – 30 – 206 337 88 – Fax: +49 – 30 – 206 337 90
Email: info@atlantic-community.org